

Denise Uses Text Based Debate to Orally Rehearse and Draft an Opinion Piece

Denise, Second Grade

Teacher speaking to whole class:

"Friends, last week we read a book that was very similar to this book. We read the book Should We Have Pets?. Thumbs up if you remember that text."

[Students hold up thumbs]

Teacher speaking to whole class:

"Yeah, we read that book and we kind of debated over whether we should have pets or we should not have pets. And in our book, the author of our book, you remember gave us all these different reasons for having pets and reasons not to have pets. Well, today were going to read another book that is very similar to that. When I say it's similar, it's written very much like that. This book is: Should There Be Zoos?. So we're going to look at reasons why 'yes, we should have zoos' and reasons 'no, we shouldn't have zoos'. We're going to debate that today, so one person in your group is going to say, 'Oh yes, we should have zoos' and then another person in your group is going to say 'No, we shouldn't have zoos'. So if you are my aisle, my window seats, that's these two on the end, ok if you're these two on the end, you're going to say, 'Yes we should have zoos'. If you're my two right here in the center, you're going to say, 'Nope, we shouldn't have zoos'. Now while we're reading today, yes, no, while were reading today you have a text in front of you. You're going to be reading along. You're going to looking for support for your side of the argument. If you're on the side 'Yes, we should have zoos' then you're going to be listening when we read for reasons that say, 'Yes, zoos are good, we should have zoos'. If you're on the side that's the center two that are 'No, we shouldn't have zoos' you're going to be listening for those reasons that say 'No we shouldn't have zoos, because of this'."

[Student speaking inaudible]

Teacher speaking to whole class:

"Alright you're going to have to do the best because you going to see mine if you need it. Let's look first at our table of contents. You don't not have that part in your book because I just copied the word pages. In our table of contents, we have argument for zoos, so I'm thinking that would be like, 'Yes' and it's called 'Extinction and Endangered Animals'. Then we have an argument against zoos, I'm thinking that's probably the, 'No, we shouldn't have them'. And it's called 'Zoochosis'. Kind of a weird word isn't it? Then we have another one. It's for zoos, it's called 'Captive Breeding and Reintroduction'. And we have an argument against zoos that's called 'Entertainment'. We have one against zoos called 'Death and Disease'. One for zoos called 'Research and Education'. Another one against zoos called 'Natural Habitats' and then an argument for zoos that's called 'Protection and Care'. And then our final thing is, 'Should there be zoos?'. That's what were going to decide today. So, let's start out with the first page that you guys have. It's called an argument for zoos, 'Extinction and Endangered Animals'."

[Teacher reads from a text that favors zoos to help curb endangerment and extinction of species in the wild]

Teacher speaking to whole class:

“So, that was kind of an argument for zoos. So, let’s think about an argument against zoos.”

[Teacher reads a text that does not favor zoos because of an animal mental illness called ‘zoochosis’ that can develop in captivity]

Teacher speaking to whole class:

“Crazy. So those were against zoos. Alright, turn knee to knee with your partner. Some of you, remember if you’re on the outside you’re saying, ‘Yes we should have zoos because in the text...’. Those in the center you’re saying, ‘No, we shouldn’t have zoos because in the text...’.”

[Student discussions inaudible]

Students debating with partners:

“Some people that work there help them, care for them, they do everything for them and they’re always watching them overnight.”

“They saw an animal, the animal shakes the bars, and when you look into their eyes you’ll see a whole bunch of sadness.”

“They’re holding on to the bars. And when you visit you can see in their deep, deep eyes that their sad. That’s what in the text it said.”

“In the text it said that our world is losing wildlife at an alarming rate that’s why I think we should have zoos.”

“Animals like to be free, animals need space.”

“I think we should have zoos because in the text it says that it helps them from putting - people putting animals in danger. Another reason is that they save animals from in the wild and they put them – they bring them to the zoo and because sometimes they have habitats – they leave their habitat quickly.”

“Killer whales they had their habitat, but like because of their noise percent, their noise percent.”

“In the text, on the other side, it says animals like bears were so – were not killed only by people, their problem is slowly climbing as their habitat begins to disappear. That’s why I think we should go to the zoo.”

“I think we shouldn’t go to the zoo because in the text they said they killed the birds and others sold the birds from the zoo.”

Teacher speaking to whole class:

“Alright my people that were ‘yes, we should have zoos’, my people on the ends, what was the reason you had? What did the text tell us, why should we have zoos? Karis?”

[Student speaking inaudible]

Teacher speaking to whole class:

“Animals can become extinct, so yes we should have zoos, because animals would become extinct. Animals would become extinct. Alright what was another reason we should have?”

Student speaking:

“Because we’re losing our wildlife.”

Teacher speaking to whole class:

“Why are we losing our wildlife? What is happening to them?”

Student speaking:

“People like to hunt them and use them for clothes or eat them.”

Teacher speaking to whole class:

“Yeah, because people are hunting them, we are losing our wildlife. So we should have zoos because our zoos help keep the wildlife right? So animals are being killed. Alright, let’s read another section. This one is an argument for zoos. So if we’re going to read now an argument for zoos, I’m thinking that is going to be my people that are like, ‘Yes, we’re for zoos, we should have zoos’, So I’m thinking this is where they can collect some their evidence so when they talk to their partner they’re going to be able to say ‘well right here it showed this’. So let’s read there.”

[Teacher reads from a text that favors zoos because of the benefits of captive breeding and reintroduction]

[Teacher reads from a text that does not favor zoos because they imprison animals for human entertainment]

Teacher speaking to whole class:

“Alright so my insides are saying, ‘Yes, we should have zoos’, so, I’m thinking yours would come from this part on ‘Captive Breeding and Reintroduction’. And then those that are saying, ‘No I am against zoos’, yours is going to be coming from the ‘Entertainment’ section, ok? So turn and talk to your partner.

[Student discussions inaudible]

Students debating with partners:

(Student speaking inaudible, disagreeing with zoos)

“That wouldn’t be fun at all. I think we should have zoos because they provide food and they take care of the new born baby. And if there wasn’t zoos, then if a big mommy – if the mommy had a baby, then there wouldn’t be anyone there to feed the baby.”

“No we should have zoos because people, like they just – they shoot them.”

“Sometimes they shock them and take food from them.”

“And they just take them to another place, where they don’t have any family and they’re living with another family.”

“I agree with you, that we should have zoos, because they should have food, shelter, and air. And if they don’t have that they will probably die or extinct, and they won’t be any animals to see and we’ll all probably just close the zoos so we won’t have animals anymore.”

“We shouldn’t have zoos because they force them to do shows and if they don’t do shows they’ll take their food away and zap them and stuff.”

(Student speaking inaudible, agreeing with zoos)

Teacher speaking to whole class and individual students:

“Alright my sides, let’s find someone who didn’t share the first time. What were some reasons ‘Yes, we should have zoos? What were some of the reasons we should have zoos? Peyton?”

Student speaking:

“Because if we didn’t – like if we did have zoos there would be people to help the new born baby.”

Teacher speaking to student:

“Yeah there would be people that would help, right?”

Student speaking:

“If we didn’t have zoos, then they were out in the wild in their habitat and the mommy had a baby, there would be no one there to feed the baby and the mama would have to leave to get food and someone could have taken the baby.”

Teacher speaking to whole class and individual students:

“Alright so if I think about what was in the text. The text in the part that you’re taking about was when they were doing what to the animals? They breed the animals and they were trying to do what? They were trying to reintroduce them. So we have people to help breed the animals. And then there are people who help to reintroduce those animals. Alright, so there are people to help reintroduce them into the wild. Alright, let’s think about why we should be against zoos. That’s my middle people. What was going on where we were like ‘Oh, we should be against zoos.’”

Student speaking:

“Because what if they get hurt during the trick and they don’t even get help.”

Teacher speaking to whole class and individual students:

“So we’re using them for entertainment, right? So one reason we should be against zoos is the animals are just used for entertainment. Alright what was another reason, Maleah?”

Student speaking:

“We shouldn’t have zoos because (inaudible).”

Teacher speaking to whole class and individual students:

“Yeah, sometimes they’re abusive towards the animals, right? If they don’t do the tricks right. Alright we’re going to stop right there because we’re going to do the next part. Just like we did the other day when we did an oral rehearsal of what we were going to write. We’re going to do that today, ok? Because you’re going to write an opinion piece and today you’re going to get to choose whether yes, you’re for zoos or no you’re against zoos. But before we do it we’re going to rehearse it. So we’re going to take the same three prompts that we used before and were going to use them today. So watch me in a way that you can handle this. We’re going to say ‘We think, yes, there should be zoos because people help introduce the animals into the wild’. Then you have to come up with an example, ‘For example the animals are bred and they ask lots of questions and then they put the animals into the wild to make more animals’. Let’s try with the ‘no’ side. Get knee to knee with your partner. You ready? You’re going to first say, ‘We think...’.”

Whole class speaking:

"We think..."

Teacher speaking to whole class:

"No we should not have zoos..."

Whole class speaking:

"No we should not have zoos..."

Teacher speaking to whole class:

"Because..."

Whole class speaking:

"Because..."

Teacher speaking to whole class:

"Zoos are abusive to animals..."

Whole class speaking:

"Zoos are abusive towards animals..."

Teacher speaking to whole class:

"That don't..."

Whole class speaking:

"That don't..."

Teacher speaking to whole class:

"Do tricks right..."

Whole class speaking:

"Do tricks right..."

Teacher speaking to whole class:

"For example..."

Whole class speaking:

“For example...”

Teacher speaking to whole class:

“Now look. They withhold food...”

Whole class speaking:

“They withhold food...”

Teacher speaking to whole class:

“They use an electric prod...”

Whole class speaking:

“They use an electric prod...”

Student speaking:

“What’s an electric prod?”

Teacher speaking to whole class and individual students:

“An electric prod is like a stick that’s got electricity running through it and when it touches you it shocks you. So what was the reason, there was one more reason? What was the other thing it gave us? They beat the animals. It says right there, ‘including beating the animal, using electric prods to shock the animal, and taking food away.’ Alright, it is sad, isn’t it? Alright, I want you to make a choice right now. You have to decide, do you think it’s right we should have zoos or do you think it’s wrong we shouldn’t have zoos?”

Whole class speaking:

“We should. We shouldn’t.”

Teacher speaking to whole class:

“You’re going to write it.”

[Students writing their opinion piece]

Teacher speaking to student:

“So what’s your reason, so I see you said, ‘No, we shouldn’t have zoos because...’ Why do you think we shouldn’t have zoos?”

Student speaking:

“Because they use tasers and take away food.”

Teacher speaking to student:

“So they’re abusive to their animals. For example they do what? They use...”

Student speaking:

“tasers and take away food.”

Teacher speaking to student:

“Perfect. I want you to think, after you finished with that, if you can think of one more.”

Student speaking:

“I can think of tons more.”

Teacher speaking to student:

“Can you? I knew you could. Alright, I want to see it.”